

**TOWN OF ABINGDON
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
REGULAR MEETING
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 1, 2023 – 5:30 P.M.
COUNCIL CHAMBERS– MUNICIPAL BUILDING**

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Review Board was held on Wednesday, November 1, 2023, at 5:30 pm in the Council Chambers in the Municipal Building.

A. WELCOME BY– Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn, Vice Chair

B. ROLL CALL – Mr. Gabriel Cristofari, Senior Planner/GIS

Members of the Board Present: **Mr. Dwayne Anderson
Mr. Peyton Boyd
Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn**

**Members Absent: Mrs. Betsy White
Mrs. Brooke Bunn**

Comprising a quorum of the Board – Yes

Administrative Town Staff: Mrs. Mayana Rice, Assistant Town Manager
Mr. Gabriel Cristofari, Senior Planner/GIS
Mr. Nick Howard, Planning Tech

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- **September 6, 2023 – Regular Meeting**

On a motion by Mrs. Hartshorn, seconded by Mr. Anderson, the board approved the minutes for September 6, 2023, Regular Meeting as presented. (VIDEO 6:14 – 6:37)

The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye
Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn	Aye

D. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 1. Certificate of Appropriateness** – *Karen W. McClanahan, 107 W. Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Changes. Located at 107 W. Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. (Tax Map 012-1-86) (VIDEO 6:38 – 11:45)*

A. Staff report

B. Applicant presentation

C. Public Comment Concerning Item

D. HPRB discussion and decision

Mr. Cristofari provided the staff report.

Karen McClanahan (Owner/Applicant) has requested approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing rear carport's corrugated metal roof with architectural asphalt shingles, add 5 in. K-style aluminum gutters and rectangular downspouts prefinished white to match existing and install a ceiling fan. The property is located at 107 W. Main Street (Parcel 012-1-86).

The property is within the Old and Historic Zoning District (Sub-District 1), Entrance Corridor Overlay, and can be seen from a public right of way therefore requiring the approval of the HPRB prior to completion.

The parcel is located in the OH Civic/Business-Focused Subdistrict (Subdistrict 1).

According to "Places In Time Volume II" by Nanci C. King the lot was used for a wagon business with a dwelling constructed in 1885. The J.L. and Martha Grant Shipley House that we see today replaced the previous dwelling and was constructed in 1938. A brick addition and carport were added to the rear of the 1938 building in 1960.

The applicant proposed to replace the existing 1960 rear carport's corrugated metal roof with architectural asphalt shingles.

The replacement architectural asphalt shingles will match the architectural asphalt shingles found on both the original 1938 building and 1960 rear addition. The architectural asphalt shingles will be Timberline, color "Weatherwood". The carport's roof dimensions are 17 ft. x 14 ft.

On the underside of the 1960 carport beadboard and a ceiling fan will be installed to give a finished look to the underside of the structure. Both the beadboard and ceiling fan will be prefinished white to match the main building's trim color.

The applicant also proposes to add 5 in. aluminum K-style gutters and rectangular downspouts onto the rear carport matching the existing K-style gutters and downspouts found on the 1960 rear addition. The original 1938 building has half round gutters and round downspouts.

If granted approval by the HPRB the applicant must apply for all applicable building permits.

Mrs. McClanahan stated that she is planning to increase the pitch on the roof. She stated that the metal posts will be removed and replaced with 6 in. x 6 in. wooden posts.

On a motion by Mr. Boyd, seconded by Mr. Anderson, the board voted to approve the application as presented.

The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye
Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn	Aye

- 2. Certificate of Appropriateness – Scott & Donna Seagle, 136 Valley Street NW., Abingdon, VA 24210. Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Changes. Located at 136 Valley Street NW., Abingdon, VA 24210. (Tax Map 012-1-57) (VIDEO 11:49 – 12:21)**

A. Staff report

B. Applicant presentation

C. Public Comment Concerning Item

D. HPRB discussion and decision

Mr. Cristofari notified the HPRB the applicant had asked to be moved to the December 6, 2023, meeting date.

The applicant had not gathered all the needed review materials as stated in their September 2023 COA and Decision Letter.

On a motion by Mr. Anderson, seconded by Mr. Boyd, the board voted to table the topic until the December meeting.

The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye
Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn	Aye

- 3. Certificate of Appropriateness – Washington County, VA, 189 E. Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Changes. Located at 189 E. Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. (Tax Map 013-1-61) (VIDEO 12:25 – 1:25:15)**

A. Staff report

B. Applicant presentation

C. Public Comment Concerning Item

D. HPRB discussion and decision

Mr. Cristofari provided the staff report.

Washington County (Owner) and Burwil Construction Company (Applicant) has requested approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing cupola windows, metal roof, and gutters. The property is located at 189 E. Main Street (Parcel 013-1-61).

The property is within the Old and Historic Zoning District (Sub-District 1), Entrance Corridor Overlay, and can be seen from a public right of way therefore requiring the approval of the HPRB prior to completion.

Parcel 013-1-61 contains four main structures addressed as 187, 189, 191, and 193 E. Main Street. The parcel is located in the OH Civic/Business-Focused Subdistrict (Subdistrict 1).

According to "Places In Time Volume I" by Nanci C. King the courthouse was constructed in 1869. Greek Revival in style, the three stories are bricked in the Flemish Bond pattern with a shallow hipped roof and Doric style columns and portico. The bracketed cornice and two-stage cupola reflect the Italianate style popular at the time. The stained-glass window designed by the Tiffany Studio was added as a memorial to those who served during World War I.

Staff was contacted by a concerned member of the community during the week of October 16th through October 20th. The notification was that the cupola windows in the 1868 courthouse were being removed. Staff went to the site and talked with the applicant's associates and stated the removal of the cupola windows and replacement of the roof have not been permitted by the HPRB. Staff directed the applicant a COA Application must be submitted into and reviewed by the HPRB before work can continue. While on site staff directed the applicant's associates to save the windows that have already been removed.

After the review on site the applicant indicated a number of items were planned to be changed:

1. The applicant proposes to replace the existing crimped dark green painted standing seam metal roof with 24-gauge metal snap lock standing seam roof with 1.5" rib height panels.
2. Replace prefinished white K-style gutters.
3. Replace prefinished white rectangular downspouts with 3" x 4" rectangular downspouts prefinished white to match existing.
4. The applicant proposed to replace the existing cupola windows (frame and panes) painted white in the existing 1868 courthouse.

The existing crimped dark green painted standing seam metal roof has no ribs, striations, or exposed fasteners. The 24-gauge metal snap lock standing seam roof with 1.5" rib height panels is

prefinished a lighter green color whereas the existing crimped standing seam metal roof is painted a darker green color. The replacement roof is a standing seam metal roof with no ribs, striations, or exposed fasteners.

K-style gutters and rectangular downspouts were not part of the original 1868 courthouse. Metal K-style gutters and rectangular downspouts did not come into use until the mid-twentieth century (1940-1960).

A historically appropriate style of metal gutter and downspout would be half round with round downspouts prefinished white. When installing new gutters, the gutter straps should be nailed under and not on top of the roofing material.

For a comparison of the two please see the photo on the next page.

The applicant proposed to replace the existing cupola windows (frames) painted white in the existing 1868 courthouse. According to the applicant, the current eight existing windows consist of one partial original wooden window with 12 of the 16 glass panes intact, six previously replaced wooden windows with plexiglass panes, and one vinyl (frame) replacement window. The eight existing windows will be replaced with wood aluminum clad windows painted white and will have the same pane patterns as the existing. All panes will be glass.

Except for one of the existing windows all other window (frames) are wooden with no vinyl or aluminum cladding. Based on the photos there are six original wooden windows with 16 panes a piece.

A few window panes are glass whereas the majority are plexiglass. Plexiglass was invented in 1933 by Otto Rohm and would not have been a material present when the courthouse was constructed in 1868. Typically, historic window panes can be easily replaced, with another pane without replacing the entire window. The change from glass to plexiglass seen here is an example of this repair technique.

All eight existing window openings can be clearly seen from either E. Main Street, N. Court Street, or Plumb Alley. According to the Design Review Guidelines, windows that are original should be preserved in their original location, size, and design and with their original materials and number of panes. When comparing the original windows (frames) to the proposed replacement there are numerous differences in the head, rail, stile and possibly muntin of the window (frame).

If replacement is deemed appropriate, and found to be necessary, the replacement window should match the window being replaced in both material and design. This includes mutins, window trim, windowsill, and any other components of the window assemblage. The original windows would not have had vinyl or aluminum cladding given the original windows were installed around 1868. When staff inspected the existing windows, they were found to have true divided panes.

The existing louvered cupola window shutters are vinyl prefinished dark green to match the color of the existing crimped standing seam metal roof. The existing vinyl louvered cupola window

shutters appear to be fixed and not operable. Additionally, photos provided by the applicant show the existing shutters do not match the height of the existing window openings. Given the date of construction and historical photographic evidence, the original window shutters were operable wooden louvered shutters. The window hardware once used appears to still exist as seen on various photos provided by the applicant. According to the Design Review Guidelines new or replacement shutters should be installed with shutter dogs and hinges of the period and not attached to the building with bolts or screws.

Mr. Self stated that the color of the new roof was painted to match the green color which was under the paint that was peeling on the previous roof. This color is not believed to be original but is older than the topcoat of paint that was previously on it.

The top portion of the roof and the roof beneath it have been replaced with new standing seam roofing.

On a motion by Mr. Boyd, seconded by Mr. Anderson, the board voted to approve the replacement of the roof as presented.

The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye
Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn	Aye

On a motion by Mr. Boyd, seconded by Mr. Anderson, the board voted to table the discussion on the gutter replacement until the next meeting.

The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye
Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn	Aye

Mr. Self provided the board with a report that shows the condition of each window that was replaced. He stated that only one window was original. 6 were replaced, and 1 was a vinyl replacement. Mr. Self guessed that the 6 windows were replaced in the 1950's.

Mr. Self stated that about 20% of the windowsills are still intact. They will need to be replaced to replicate what was there originally.

Mr. Cristofari clarified that just because plexiglass was found in some of the windows, this does not mean that they are not original. A single pane could have broken and been replaced with plexiglass, while still being the original window.

Abingdon resident, Mr. Byrum Geisler, addressed the board for public comment. He stated that he believed that the windows should be repaired and reinstalled instead of replaced with replicas, to maintain the history of the building as much as possible.

Abingdon resident, Mr. Rick Humphries, addressed the board for public comment. He recommended that the applicant contact DHR representative Mike Pulice regarding restoring the original windows. He stated that he is in favor of repair instead of replacing the windows.

Abingdon resident, Mr. Jeff Johnson, addressed the board for public comment. He stated that since the creation of the Historic Preservation Review Board, it has been the stance of the board that if it is possible to repair a historic feature of a building, you should repair it. If repair is not possible then you should replace them with like features (ex. wood for wood). He would like to see the original windows repaired.

On a motion by Mr. Boyd, seconded by Mr. Anderson, the board voted to grant a conditional approval based on the following conditions.

- 1. Approved the repair of the original and the first replacement cupola windows. The windows to be repaired are the wooden 16 pane and 12 pane windows. *These cannot be “replaced” but must be “repaired”***
- 2. Create a new window matching the original to replace the existing 16 pane vinyl clad cupola window. *No vinyl windows are allowed,***
- 3. All repaired or replacement windows must have restoration glass panes. *The removal of the “Plexiglas or modern glass is required”***

The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye
Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn	Aye

E. PUBLIC COMMENTS

F. OLD BUSINESS/MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA (VIDEO 43:26 – 1:21:55)

- Historic Preservation Day After Event Discussion**
- COA Extension – 203 W. Valley Street (Chimney Repair)**
- COA Waiver – 108 E. Main Street (Gutter Replacement)**
- COA Waiver – 143 W. Main Street (Front Porch Repair)**
- COA Waiver – 215 E. Valley Street (Repointing Brick Walkway and Repainting Wooden Trim)**
- COA Waiver – 270 Valley Street NE. (Roof Replacement)**
- COA Waiver – 106 Valley Street NW. (Tree Removal & Replacement)**
- COA Waiver – 313 Valley Street NW (Repainting)**
- COA Waiver – 423 Valley Street NE (Roof Replacement)**

G. ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Boyd motioned to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Anderson.

Meeting adjourned at 6:53 P.M.

Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn, Vice Chair



Mr. Gabriel Cristofari, Senior Planner/GIS Specialist

