# TOWN OF ABINGDON HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD REGULAR MEETING WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2023 – 5:30 P.M. COUNCIL CHAMBERS– MUNICIPAL BUILDING

A regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Review Board was held on Wednesday, December 6, 2023, at 5:30 pm in the Council Chambers in the Municipal Building.

- A. WELCOME BY- Mrs. Betsy White, Chair
- B. ROLL CALL Mr. Gabriel Cristofari, Senior Planner/GIS

Members of the Board Present: Mr. Dwayne Anderson

Mr. Brooke Bunn Mrs. Betsy White Mr. Peyton Boyd

Members Absent: Mrs. Kristi Hartshorn

## Comprising a quorum of the Board – Yes

Administrative Town Staff: Mrs. Mayana Rice, Assistant Town Manager

Mr. Gabriel Cristofari, Senior Planner/GIS

Mr. Nick Howard, Planning Tech

## C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

• November 1, 2023 - Regular Meeting

On a motion by Mr. Boyd seconded by Mr. Anderson, the board tabled the approval of the minutes for November 1, 2023, Regular Meeting until the next regularly scheduled meeting. (VIDEO 6:14-6:51)

# D. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. Tax Abatement – Robert Legard, 203 Valley Street NW, Abingdon, VA 24210. Application for Tax Abatement. Located at 203 Valley Street NW, Abingdon, VA 24210. (Tax Map 012-6-1) (VIDEO 7:00 – 10:05)

- A. Staff report
- **B.** Applicant presentation
- C. HPRB discussion and decision

Mr. Cristofari provided the staff report.

Robert L. Legard (Owner/Applicant) is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Tax Abatement for repairs to three chimneys.

The applicant received COA approval in October 2022. In October 2023 the applicant requested and was approved by staff for a COA approval extension. The COA extension was presented to the HPRB at their November Meeting.

Now they are requesting the Tax Abatement COA approval allowed per Section 66-71 of the Town of Abingdon, VA. Upon approval by the HPRB the request will be submitted to the Town Manager.

Staff recommend approval of the request for Tax Abatement per our analysis of the receipts. The allowed tax abatement is \$5,000.

The applicant was not present for the meeting.

On a motion by Mrs. Bunn, seconded by Mr. Anderson, the board voted to approve the application as presented.

The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mrs. Brooke Bunn	Aye
Mrs. Betsy White	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye

- **2.** Certificate of Appropriateness Patricia Woody, 411 E. Valley Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Changes. Located at 411 Valley Street NE, Abingdon, VA 24210. (Tax Map 013-1-26A) (VIDEO 10:15 19:51)
  - A. Staff report
  - **B.** Applicant presentation
  - C. HPRB discussion and decision

Mr. Cristofari provided the staff report.

Patricia E. Woody (Owner/Applicant) has requested approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to attach a stone veneer to an existing concrete retaining wall and repaint the front porch and carport iron railing systems black. The property is located at 411 E. Valley Street (Parcel 013-1-26A).

The property is within the Old and Historic Zoning District (Sub-District 2).

According to the Washington County land card the ranch style building, currently addressed 411 E. Valley Street was constructed in 1966 and is currently a non-contributing building. Additionally, the building is located outside of DHR's designated Abingdon Historic District.

The applicant proposed to attach a stone veneer to an existing concrete retaining wall and repaint the existing iron railing systems for the front porch and carport black.

On 11/15/2023 staff issued a stop work order for the project. The applicant indicated to staff their contractor would finish the work even after being told to stop. Staff notified the applicant of the possibility of the HPRB making a motion to have the stone veneer removed.

The stone used to clad the existing concrete retaining wall located between 411 E. Valley Street and 423 E. Valley Street is natural and varied in earthen tones. The veneer is set in a random design and is attached to the existing concrete retaining wall using metal lath and a Portland based cement mortar. The mortar for the veneer matches the existing concrete raining wall in material and color.

When looking at the property on Google Street View the existing concrete retaining wall was painted red as shown in 2018. When looking at Google Street View in 2021 most if not all the red paint had come off most likely due to weathering. Staff could not verify through historical documentation if the retaining wall is original to the 1966 building or not.

The existing iron railing system is black, thus repainting the existing iron railing system black will match the existing color scheme. This is a COA Waiver eligible action.

Mr. Cristofari clarified that upon issuing the stop work order, the work continued until completion. Mr. Cristofari conveyed to the applicant that if the board chooses, the applicant could be forced to remove any work that was completed without authorization.

Mrs. White emphasized the fact that this building is considered a non-contributing structure.

On a motion by Mr. Boyd, seconded by Mrs. Bunn, the board voted to approve the application as submitted.

### The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mrs. Brooke Bunn	Aye
Mrs. Betsy White	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye

- 3. Certificate of Appropriateness Mark Goodman, 108 E. Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Changes. Located at 108 E. Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. (Tax Map 012-1-101) (VIDEO 20:00 39:53)
  - A. Staff report
  - **B.** Applicant presentation
  - C. HPRB discussion and decision

Mr. Cristofari provided the staff report.

Mark Goodman (Owner/Applicant) has requested approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the front porch roof's wooden balustrade. The property is located at 108 E. Main Street (Parcel 012-1-101).

The property is within the Old and Historic Zoning District (Sub-District 1), Entrance Corridor Overlay, and can be seen from a public right of way therefore requiring the approval of the HPRB prior to completion.

According to "Places In Time Volume II" by Nanci C. King the Sutton House was constructed sometime from 1893-1895 by John F. and Charles C. Sutton. The current 2 ½- story three bay wide brick building took the place of the removed Barr House, a 2-story brick house. The Barr House located on this lot was constructed in 1861 by John W. Barr.

The applicant proposes to permanently remove the existing front porch roof's wooden balustrade painted white. According to the applicant the balustrade was replaced approximately 4 years ago and is causing related water damage to the front porch. This has caused significant wood damage over the years. Several beams were replaced in 2015 and more will need to be replaced now. The goal is to bring the porch back to its apparent 1913 appearance.

Other items related to the overall project that have been waived by staff include.

1. Replacement of existing half-round gutters and round downspouts on the front porch with new half-round gutters prefinished the same color, but replacements would be 1 in. larger than existing.

- 2. Replace all the rotted and damaged wood on the front porch and paint it white to match existing. All wood will look the same as it does now.
- 3. Replace the existing prefinished black standing seam metal roof with no ribs, striations, or exposed fasteners on the front porch with a new black standing seam roof to match existing.

Through studying various Sanborn maps staff have observed the front porch for this building has gone through numerous iterations throughout the building's history. In 1897 the Sutton House had a wooden full length 1-story porch. By 1902 the wooden 1-story full length front porch was taken in on either side creating a partial full-length porch. Then in 1913 the center portion of the wooden full length 1-story porch was extended towards E. Main Street. The wooden 1-story partial full length front porch has maintained its 1913 footprint. Staff cannot confirm if the full-length front porch as seen in the 1897 Sanborn map was simply altered throughout the years or demolished and replaced.

According to "Places In Time Volume II" the Sutton House's front porch is shown with a standing seam metal roof but no balustrade. The roof shape of the front porch pictured below is cascading hipped, sheathed in standing seam metal.

The current roof shape of the front porch is hipped with a centrally shaped rectangle extruding vertically.

Mr. Boyd stated that based on his architectural archive, and his previous work with the previous owner. The porch in question did not exist years ago.

On a motion by Mrs. Bunn, the board voted to approve the application with the following conditions.

- 1. The existing front porch metal standing seam roof prefinished black with no ribs, striations, or exposed fasteners, will be replaced with a metal standing seam roof prefinished black with no ribs, striations, or exposed fasteners to match existing.
- 2. The replacement front porch roof's shape will match the existing roof's.
- 3. The existing wooden painted white balustrade will be removed and not replaced.
- 4. The applicant reached out to staff on 12/7/2023 about wanting to place roof cleats on the front porch matching the roof cleats found on the main building's roof. Staff approved the installation of the roof cleats on the

# front porch to match existing cleats found on the main building's roof.

#### The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mrs. Brooke Bunn	Aye
Mrs. Betsy White	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye

- **4.** Certificate of Appropriateness Washington County, VA, 189 E. Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Changes. Located at 189 E. Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210. (Tax Map 013-1-61) (VIDEO 39:55 44:15)
  - A. Staff report
  - **B.** Applicant presentation
  - C. HPRB discussion and decision

Washington County (Owner) and Burwil Construction Company (Applicant) has requested approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing K-style gutters and rectangular downspouts. The property is located at 189 E. Main Street (Parcel 013-1-61).

The property is within the Old and Historic Zoning District (Sub-District 1), Entrance Corridor Overlay, and can be seen from a public right of way therefore requiring the approval of the HPRB prior to completion.

According to "Places In Time Volume I" by Nanci C. King the courthouse was constructed in 1869. Greek Revival in style, the three stories are bricked in the Flemish Bond pattern with a shallow hipped roof and Doric style columns and portico. The bracketed cornice and two-stage cupola reflect the Italianate style popular at the time. The stained-glass window designed by the Tiffany Studio was added as a memorial to those who served during World War I.

The applicant proposed to replace existing prefinished white K-style gutters and rectangular downspouts with half round gutters and round downspouts prefinished white to match existing color.

When installing new gutters, the gutter straps should be nailed under and not on top of the roofing material.

The Design Review Guidelines do not set a size limitation on replacement gutters and downspouts. Currently half round gutters come in 6", 7", and 8". Based on the project proposal no current areas without guttering or downspouts will be altered.

On a motion by Mr. Anderson, seconded by Mrs. Bunn, the board voted to approve the application as presented with the following conditions.

- 1. The existing metal k-style gutters and rectangular downspouts be replaced with 6 in. metal half round gutters and round downspouts.
- 2. Gutter straps will be nailed under and not on top of the roofing material.
- 3. The replacement gutters and downspouts will be prefinished white to match the existing color scheme.

## The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mrs. Brooke Bunn	Aye
Mrs. Betsy White	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS - None**

## E. BUSINESS/MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA (VIDEO 44:30 – 1:00:55)

- Stop Work Order 334 E. Valley Street
- Letter to 131 E. Main Street
- COA Waiver 127 W. Main Street (Walk of Fame Stars)
- COA Waiver 239 E. Main Street (Tree Removal)
- COA Waiver 309 W. Valley Street (Replacement & Painting Clapboards)
- COA Waiver 423 E. Valley Street (Gutter & Downspout Replacement)
- COA Waiver Creeper Trail Head (Lighting Installation)
- COA Waiver Shelter Behind 300 Green Spring Road (Lighting Installation)
- COA Waiver 123 Russell Road (Roof Replacement)
- Discussion Concerning Placement of Summers Building Projecting Sign
   -The HPRB stated they were satisfied with the location of the installed sign and no further action is required.
- Review and Discussion on Design Guideline Revision Comments

#### G. ADJOURNMENT

On motion by Mr. Anderson, seconded by Mr. Boyd, the board voted to adjourn the meeting.

# The roll call vote was as follows:

Mr. Dwayne Anderson	Aye
Mrs. Brooke Bunn	Aye
Mrs. Betsy White	Aye
Mr. Peyton Boyd	Aye

Mrs. White declared the meeting adjourned.

Meeting adjourned at 6:26 P. M.

Betsy White, Chair

Gabriel Cristofari, Senior Planner/GIS

8