

TOWN OF ABINGDON
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
REGULAR MEETING
JULY 1, 2009 - 5:00 P.M.

The regular meeting of the Board of Architectural Review was held Wednesday, July 1, 2009 at 5:00 P.M. The meeting was held in the Municipal Building, Downstairs Meeting Room.

Dr. Charles M. Owens, Chairman, called the meeting to order. Mr. Jackson called the roll.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Dr. Charles M. Owens, Chairman
Mr. Peyton Boyd
Mr. Jason Berry
Mrs. Doris Shuman

Comprising a quorum of the Board

Members Absent: Mr. Byrum Geisler

Administrative Staff: Mr. W. Garrett Jackson, Director of Planning
Mr. Sean Taylor, Assistant Director Planning/Zoning
Mrs. Deborah Icenhour, Town Attorney
Mr. John Dew, Director of Public Services and Construction
Mr. Jim Smith, Director Wastewater Operations/Town Engineer

Visitors: Mr. Robert M. Howard
Mr. Jay P. Porterfield

* * * * *

(2) Approval of Minutes Regular Meeting, June 3, 2009

Mrs. Shuman made a motion that the minutes of the regular meeting, June 3, 2009, be approved as presented. Mr. Boyd seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

(3) CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - **Highlands Union Bank, Robert M. Howard, Representative, 340 West Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210**; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval of fence to be **located at 274 West Valley Street. Tax Map No. 11 (1) 94.**

This is a request for approval of a fence to be located on the western side of property located at 274 West Valley Street, to extend toward West Valley Street no further than the edge of the front porch. The proposed fence will be constructed of pressure-treated lumber and will be 26 ft. in length and 6 ft. in height. The proposed fence will be attached to an existing wood railing that protects the top of a retaining wall that is approximately 10 ft. in height.

After discussion Mrs. Shuman made a motion to approve fence subject to fence being set back to the width of porch, edge of the house, having solid pieces of wood painted white, with structure facing Highlands Unions house, with fence going back to the alley. Mr. Berry seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

- (4) **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - Highlands Union Bank, Robert M. Howard, Representative, 340 West Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval of parking area to be located at 274 West Valley Street. Tax Map No. 11 (1) 94.**

This is a request that was discussed at the January 21, 2009 meeting, at which time pea gravel was approved to be used on the proposed parking area to be located at 274 West Valley Street.

After further consideration, the applicant is now requesting that pavement be used instead of pea gravel on the proposed parking area. The parking area will have a slight grade and gravel will tend to wash off toward Plumb Alley into the two drop inlets that handle the water runoff. The use of pea gravel also eliminates the ability to line off the lot to maximum the number of parking spots. There is also the possibility that the pea gravel would not allow the marking of required handicapped space in the parking lot. A pea gravel lot also will not allow snow removal using a plow due to the snow plow removing gravel from the lot as the snow and ice is plowed.

The applicant’s proposed plans are to cap the three existing parking lots on Highlands Union Bank property at 250 and 266 West Valley Street, and would like to have the lot at 274 West Valley Street paved with asphalt to make all the adjoining lots contiguous in surface.

After discussion, Mr. Berry made a motion that this meeting not be adjourned and that this application be tabled, allowing the Town staff and the applicant, the opportunity to explore alternatives that would fall within the Guidelines. A decision will be made within two weeks. Mr. Boyd seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

- (5) **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - Mary Dudley Porterfield, Owner (Cave House Property), Jay P. Porterfield, Representative, 10453 Old Mill Road, P.O. Box 187, Glade Spring, VA 24340; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval of demolition of existing structure located at 279 East Main Street. Tax Map No. 13 (1) 69.**

This is a request for approval of demolition of existing structure located at 279 East Main Street, due to major damage of the structure.

The Browning Group, LLC, a professional engineering firm, completed a visit to the above-referenced site to make observations of the subject building’s existing structural conditions. The following is a summary of their findings:

The subject building is a two-story, brick and wood framed structure approximately 21 ft. wide by 42 ft. long with two (2) sleeping rooms and a bathroom on the second floor, a living room and kitchen on the first floor. The exterior walls are multi-width brick construction with the longitudinal walls being load bearing (walls support roof and floor). An approximate 10 ft. by 21 ft. brick addition is present on the rear of the building.

From the exterior, it was observed that aged brick with mortar joints need repointing, as well as failure of the lower portion of the brick wall at the southeastern corner. It was also observed that the brick walls were not level, which indicates settling of the

foundation has occurred. The southeastern corner roofing, fascia and gutter system appeared to be in need of repair, which could be contributing to water damage to the foundation and brick walls.

From the interior, it was observed that floors are not level, allowing one to see through to the outside at the southeastern building corner.

It was confirmed on site that the existing first floor wood framing is resting on the earth below, and the building is without a crawl space. With this condition being present, it is possible that the exterior brick walls are constructed without a footing, or with a minimal footing.

An estimated cost for repairing the observed structural deficiencies of \$137,340.00 doesn't include non-structural repairs/remodeling and should be provided by an architect or qualified builder.

Based on a finished, occupied residential building value of \$159,000.00 (approximately \$90.00 per square foot of finished floor area), and the estimated structural repairs costing \$137,340.00 (approximately 86% of the estimated building value), it is a professional opinion that it is not financially feasible to perform the observed structural repairs.

Mr. Taylor explained that the structure is believed to have been built sometime in the period of 1870's – 1880's.

Dr. Owens, referring to the Guidelines, Page 7, explains that the definition of demolition is as follows:

Demolition

- a. Demolition of any original feature or part of a pre-1945 building should be avoided.
- b. Any building that contributes to the historic or architectural significance of the Old and Historic District or to another locally designated district should not be demolished unless at least one of the following factors is present:
 - 1) *Public Emergency*: An emergency condition exists in which the public safety and welfare requires the removal of the building.
 - 2) *Non-contributing*: The building does not contribute to the historic or architectural character of the District.

Dr. Owens further stated that this structure does have historical significance and contributes to the architectural significance to the Historic District. It is a pre-1945 building and in his opinion, if the Board agrees to demolish the structure, the Board would be setting a precedence for other buildings in the Town with poor maintenance, the attractive option to demolish rather than maintaining them, therefore, it is his personal opinion not to demolish the structure.

Mr. Berry suggested that maybe this structure would qualify for a grant or some other funding. Mr. Jackson responded by saying that the only way something like this could take place would be to have a long- term lease of 99 years with the Cave Have Co-op Organization or if the Cave House Co-op Organization owned the property.

Mrs. Icenhour stated that safety concerns should be taken into consideration when making a decision on this request for demolition of the structure. Mr. Berry, among others were in agreement with the safety issue of the structure.

After a lengthy discussion, Mr. Berry made a motion that the request for demolition be denied, with recommendation that the applicant make an appeal, if so desired, to the Town Council from the Board’s decision. Mrs. Shuman seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

- (6) **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIAENESS - Cumberland Resources Corporation, Owner, Peyton Boyd, Representative, 153 West Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval of renovation and addition to existing structure located at 143 West Main Street. Tax Map No. 12 (1) 79.**

Mr. Boyd explained that this is a request for approval of proposed renovation and addition to existing structure located at 143 West Main Street. He continued to explain the following proposed changes which include:

- 1. **PROPOSED ADDITION**
Brick foundation, clapboard siding. eaves, gable and other trim, columns, guardrail and shutters to match existing structure and standing seam metal roofing.
(Material samples will be submitted August 2009 Board of Architectural Review Meeting).
- 2. **EXISTING STRUCTURE PROPOSED CHANGES**
Existing trim, etc. to be repaired, replacing existing metal roof with new standing seam roofing, new wood front porch floor to replace inappropriate concrete slab.

A site plan, landscape design and ramp for handicapped access will be submitted at a later date.

After discussion, Mrs. Shuman made a motion that this application be approved as presented, subject to trying to salvage the cupola. Mr. Berry seconded the motion.

VOTE:	Mrs. Shuman	Aye
	Mr. Berry	Aye
	Dr. Owens	Aye
	Mr. Boyd	Abstained

The motion passed.

* * * * *

There being no further business, a motion was made, duly seconded, and unanimously approved that this meeting reconvene within two weeks with decision on the parking area ground cover for Highlands Union Bank.

Dr. Charles M. Owens, Chairman

W. Garrett Jackson, Secretary