

TOWN OF ABINGDON
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
REGULAR MEETING
May 24, 2006 - 5:00 P.M
(RESCHEDULED FROM JUNE 7, 2006)

The regular meeting of the Board of Architectural Review was held Wednesday, May 24, 2006 at 5:00 P.M. This meeting was rescheduled from Wednesday, June 7, 2006. The meeting was held in the Municipal Building, Downstairs Meeting Room.

Mrs. Betsy White, Chairman, called the meeting to order, welcoming visitors and explaining the purposes of the Board of Architectural Review.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Mrs. Betsy White, Chairman
Mr. Harry McKinney
Mr. Thomas C. Phillips
Mrs. Doris Shuman
Mr. Andrew Hargroves

Comprising a quorum of the Board

Members Absent: None

Administrative Staff: Mr. W. Garrett Jackson, Director of Planning/Zoning

Visitors: Mr. Matthew Crum
Mr. Robert Campbell
Mrs. Gwen Campbell
Mr. Gary M. Kimbrell
Mrs. Susan M. Kimbrell

* * * * *

- (2) Certificate of Appropriateness - **The Nature Conservancy, Matthew Crum**, 146 East Main Street, Abingdon, Virginia 24210; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace roof and guttering of existing structure located at **146 East Main Street. Tax Map No. 13 (1) 116. (Tabled from the regular meeting, May 3, 2006).**

This is a request for approval to replace existing roof and guttering on structure located at 146 East Main Street. The application was tabled from the regular meeting, May 4, 2006, allowing Mr. Crum and his contractor to research information regarding the materials to be used in this project.

Replacement Of Roof

At the May 3rd meeting, Mr. Crum stated that regarding replacement of the roof, the upper portion of the roof is covered with metal shingles, the lower portion of the roof is covered with a seamed metal roof, with the upper portion being in a very deteriorated condition. It is the desire of the applicant, in replacing the roof, that the entire roof be consistent with the same materials.

Mr. Fluke, contractor, stated that it requested to be allowed to replace the roofing with a 29-gauge, multi-ribbed panel, gray in color.

Mr. McKinney advised that the Guidelines were not real specific concerning metal roofing, however, the intent of the Board is to require replacement of materials that would be similar to material that would be a part of the historic fabric of Abingdon. He further stated that to be the most consistent in roofing in Town is that you have more narrow ribs rather than the intermediate style. He explained that the Board tries to promote the use of this same system which has a concealed fastener, or a more narrow rib, not so much of a pronounced intermediate rib.

Mr. Crum explained that the cost of the materials that Mr. McKinney referred to was approximately 35% more and due to being a non-profit organization, the difference in cost would pose a financial burden. Mr. Fluke stated the reason for the difference in cost being two factors, the material cost and labor cost for installation.

Mr. McKinney didn't think the Board could deny the use of exposed fasteners, but the roofing must have a different profile, having a narrower ridge on the top.

Mr. Crum indicated his appreciation and concerns of the historic character of the area and he did not try to sway the Board one way or the other; his concern was that the roof needs to be replaced and whether or not they can afford to replace it.

Mrs. White asked if Mr. Crum had explored having the roof cleaned and repainted. He and Mr. Fluke responded by saying had the roof been maintained over the years, that cleaning and repainting could be a possibility but leaks have developed causing deterioration and the most feasible thing to do is to replace the roof.

At the May 3rd meeting, Mr. McKinney recommended that the applicant research this matter and he stated that he felt that the applicant would be able to find a roof closer to the suggested profile and that there would not be much difference in the cost of the two.

The applicant and contractor agreed to this suggestion and after having contacting many sources and reviewing their budget, it was been determined that a standing seam roof, 24 gauge metal, gray in color will be used, as previously recommended by the Board.

Replacement Of Guttering

At the May 3rd meeting, Mr. Crum stated that it is requested that 5-inch K Style, seamless guttering be approved for use to the replace the existing guttering. The existing guttering is the same type guttering as requested.

At that time, Mr. McKinney advised Mr. Crum that the Guidelines specifically state that the guttering should not be this style, however, since the existing guttering is the same style as requested, the Board can approve this request and only ask that the applicant consider half-round guttering, since it is the preferred style. Mr. Crum stated that he had explored the possibility of the half-round guttering and that the cost was much more than the type requested for approval.

After reconsideration of the guttering, Mr. Crum is once again requesting that 5-inch K Style, seamless guttering be approved for use in replacing the guttering. After discussion, Mrs. Shuman made a motion that the roof material and guttering be approved, as requested. Mr. McKinney seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

- (6) Certificate of Appropriateness - **Robert and Gwen Campbell, Owners, Gwen Campbell, Representative**, 118 Valley Street, N.W., Abingdon, Virginia 24210; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to remove existing carport roof and install composite decking and new exterior door for kitchen of structure located at **118 Valley Street, N.W. Tax Map No. 12 (1) 54. (Tabled from regular meeting, May 3, 2006).**

This application was tabled from the regular meeting, April 5, 2006 and again on May 3, 2006, due to lack of detailed information regarding the proposed construction, including scaled drawings and materials to be used for the columns, balusters and railings.

The application is requesting approval to remove existing carport roof and install composite decking and new exterior door for kitchen of structure located at 118 Valley Street, N.W.

Mr. and Mrs. Campbell were present at the meeting on May 3rd and presented new plans for the proposed construction.

The newest plans for the proposed construction included the removal of the existing carport and replace with a carport with a deck area above. The deck surface would be a redwood color composite with treated lumber support columns. The railing would be wood-grain composite, white in color. A new 10 light door will be installed in kitchen. Ten solar powered lights would be installed on corners of railing around deck area.

The size of center rails would be 1 in. x 1 in., covered with a synthetic slip cover, white in color, with main support posts to be 6" x 6" posts with plan to extend the support posts above deck to appropriate height to be used as main posts, with cover over main posts. The main posts will be pressure treated wood.

Mr. McKinney stated that the treated posts should either be painted or stained with opaque stain to blend with main structure.

After discussion, it was the consensus of the Board that they would meet on the site after the meeting and view a more detailed sample sketch located on the property site.

As a review of this application request, after having met with the Board on site May 3th, it was determined that a roof would be used for the deck. Mr. and Mrs. Campbell presented new plans for the proposed construction, based upon the suggestions made by Mr. McKinney and Mr. Hargroves.

After further discussion, with a few minor suggestions by the Board, Mrs. Shuman made a motion that this application be approved. Mr. McKinney seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

- (7) Certificate of Appropriateness - **Gary M. and Susan M. Kimbrell**, 244 Valley Street, N.W., Abingdon, Virginia 24210; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace existing shingle roof with metal roof on existing structure located at **244 Valley Street, N.W.. Tax Map No. 13 (1) 36. (Tabled from regular meeting May 3, 2006).**

This is a request for approval to replace existing shingle roof with metal roof on structure located at 244 Valley Street, N.W.

Replacement Of Roof

As a review of this application, at the May 3rd meeting Mr. Kimbrell stated that after having patched the existing roof several times, more leakage has developed and it had been decided that the roof needed to be replaced. He further stated that since the structure originally had a metal shingle roof, it was being requested that a standing seam roof, brown in color, be approved to replace the existing shingle roof.

Mr. McKinney asked if a synthetic shingle such as slate or wood shake shingle had been considered. He stated that a synthetic shingle is available, constructed of wood but looks like a metal shingle; a synthetic slate is also available. He felt that this type roof would be more appropriate for this type structure than a standing steam metal roof.

Mr. Hargroves stated that this house was built during the 1800 – 1900’s and after doing research on this, found that metal shingles were used but standing seam metal roofing was not used on this type house.

After discussion, it was suggested by the Board that the applicant research this matter for other availabilities before a final decision is made by the Board.

Mr. and Mrs. Kimbrell were present at this meeting. Mr. Kimbrell stated that after having researched this matter, it was their decision to eliminate the previous requested standing seam metal roof. In his research it was found that slate and wood shingles are predominate for this type structure, therefore, it is now being requested that a synthetic slate, dark charcoal gray in color and having a 50 year warranty, by EcoStar, be approved for the replacement roof.

After discussion, Mr. McKinney made a motion that the requested synthetic slate, as presented, be approved. Mr. Shuman seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

- (8) Certificate of Appropriateness - **Doris and Kenny Shuman**, 164 Valley Street, N.W., Abingdon, Virginia 24210; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to repaint ceiling of porch and replace existing porch ceiling lights with white fans on upper and lower porch for structure located at **164 Valley Street, N.W.. Tax Map No. 12 (1) 61.**

This is a request to repaint ceiling of porch, changing color from white to light blue (Wisp Blue) as used in Charleston, South Carolina and Key West and replace existing porch ceiling lights with white fans on upper and lower porch.

After discussion, Mr. McKinney made a motion to approve Wisp Blue (or lighter) paint for porch ceiling and Harbor Breeze 52-inch ceiling fans, white in color, as presented. Mr. Hargroves seconded the motion, with unanimous approval, with Mrs. Shuman abstaining.

* * * * *

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned

Betsy White, Chairman

W. Garrett Jackson, Secretary