

TOWN OF ABINGDON
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 4, 2011 - 5:00 P.M.

The regular meeting of the Board of Architectural Review was held Wednesday, May 4, 2011 at 5:00 P.M. The meeting was held in the downstairs meeting room of the Municipal Building.

Dr. Charles M. Owens, Chairman, called the meeting to order. Mr. Jackson called the roll.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Dr. Charles M. Owens, Chairman
 Mr. Byrum Geisler
 Mr. Jason Berry
 Mr. Peyton Boyd
 Mrs. Betsy White

Comprising a quorum of the Board

Members Absent: None

Administrative Staff: Mr. W. Garrett Jackson, Director of Planning/Zoning
 Mr. Sean Taylor, Assistant Director Planning/Zoning
 Mrs. Deborah Icenhour, Town Attorney

Visitors: Mr. Carl Mallory
 Mr. Jim Bundy

(2) Approval of Minutes: Regular Meeting, April 6, 2011

Mr. Berry made a motion that the minutes of the regular meeting, April 6, 2011 be approved with the following correction:

Item 3, Page 11-14, Second Paragraph

FROM: After discussion, Mr. Boyd made a motion that the original door should be retained and refinished as near to its original appearance as possible. Mr. Berry seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

TO: **After discussion, Mr. Boyd made a motion to approve all proposed changes except the door and that a new door will be presented to the Board for review at a later date. Mr. Berry seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.**

Mr. Geisler seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

COPY

- (3) **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - Carl and Polly Mallory, Owners, 112 East Main Street, Abingdon, VA 24210; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace existing roof, with new metal roof, on structure located at 112 East Main Street. Tax Map No. 12 (1) 100.**

This is a request to replace existing roof, with new metal roof, on structure located at 112 East Main Street.

Dr. Owens explained that it was his understanding that Mr. Mallory proposes to use a different material other than what is approved in the Guidelines.

Mr. Mallory explained that he proposes to replace the existing roof with 29 gauge, ribbed metal roof, dark brown in color. He has observed and counted several houses in the Old and Historic District having ribbed metal roof and he proposes to use the same type. Mr. Mallory presented a sample of the proposed metal roof.

Mr. Mallory also stated that the structure was built in 1890 and pictures made in the 1970's reveal that the existing roof is a 5v crimp metal roof, which has been painted and tarred several times.

Mr. Boyd stated that the original roof for the structure would have been a tin roof, having been painted over the years.

Mr. Mallory stated that he had met with approximately four or five different contractors. He indicated that he had signed a contract with his preferred contractor, with plans to use this particular metal roof for various reasons, one being that it was less expensive.

Dr. Owens explained that the 5v crimp metal roof is flat from rib to rib; the other product (ribbed metal roof) does not have the rib to rib effect.

It was also explained to Mr. Mallory that the roofs on the structures he referenced were installed before the Guidelines were established and they are now grandfathered.

Mr. Boyd stated that if this is the original roof, Mr. Mallory can replace it like with like, if he chooses.

Mr. Geisler asked it would be acceptable to Mr. Mallory if he could get the 5v crimp metal roof, brown in color, in the older looking profile? Mr. Mallory responded that it would depend upon if there had been an increase in the cost and if it took longer to get the material.

Mr. Jackson and Mr. Berry explained to Mr. Mallory that the Town has a Tax Abatement Ordinance and reviewed the incentives in detail with him, as presented by Mrs. Deborah Icenhour, Town Attorney.

Mr. Geisler explained to Mr. Mallory that it is the Board's responsibility to protect the Old and Historic District and that they would not be inclined to approve the requested profile.

Mr. Mallory stated that in order to take advantage of the Tax Abatement Ordinance, in order to offset the cost, he might reconsider this request, using the Board's recommendation, if a compromise could be reached, changing the requested color from dark brown to burnish slate. Mr. Mallory will contact the Town Staff before his final decision is made, to determine what tax incentives he might be eligible for.

COPY

After a lengthy discussion, Mr. Boyd made a motion to approve the installation of the 5v crimp metal roof, burnish slate in color, versus steel 4026. Mr. Geisler seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

- (4) CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - **Tim Nichols**, 229 East Valley Street, Abingdon, VA 24210; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a small porch roof over entrance door for property **located at 229 East Valley Street. Tax Map No. 13 (1) 16.**

This is a request to construct a small porch roof over entrance door for existing structure located at 229 East Valley Street.

The construction of the proposed porch roof will consist of wood trim, painted White to match the existing structure, with cedar shakes to match the existing roof.

After a lengthy discussion regarding this structure, Mr. Geisler made a motion that the request be denied. Mrs. White seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

* * * * *

- (5) CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - **Martha E. Combs**, P. O. Box 1404, Abingdon, VA 24212; application for Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to renovate/remodel existing structure **located at 268 East Main Street. Tax Map No. 13 (1) 93.**

This application was discussed at the regular meetings, Wednesday, February 2, 2011, Wednesday, March 2, 2011 and Wednesday, April 6, 2011. All requested changes and proposed architectural improvements to the property have been approved except the discussion regarding the original front door, as to whether or not it would be feasible to remove the original front door of the structure and replace it with a new door, or to refurbish the original door.

As end result of the meeting held on April 6, 2011 "Mr. Boyd made a motion to approve all proposed changes except the door and that a new door will be presented to the Board for review at a later date. Mr. Berry seconded the motion, with unanimous approval."

After further review and a later discussion between Board members, Mr. Geisler made a motion to re-open the discussion of this topic, to reconsider this discussion, allowing the door and transom to be removed. Mrs. White seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

Mr. Taylor explained that had he, along with Rick Statzer and Marion Watts, the Building Department Officials, had inspected the house regarding this issue. He further explained that this is one of the main entrances to this structure and since there will be a change in the use of this house, it will be left up to Building Department Officials to decide whether the door will have to be raised; it will be necessary to wait for the Building Department to receive required blueprints from Mr. Bundy as to what decision can be required. Mr. Taylor stated that he has discussed this matter with a contractor who has stated that if the door does have to be raised, the door and transom could be combined using all original elements that could be incorporated to reconstruct the door.

Mr. Boyd stated he could see no difference in doing this, opposed to installing a new door. He further stated that due to this structure being located in the Old and Historic District, the Building Official by law and the code, has the right to approve the use of the original door as it currently

appears if it is not life threatening. He further stated that taking all the existing parts and making one door does not accomplish what is intended to be accomplished; it might appear that one is preserving the door's appearance but it is not preserving the original door. He suggested the door be left as it is, depending on the dispensation from the Building Official.

After a lengthy discussion, the Board agreed that before a decision could be made they must wait for the blueprints from Mr. Bundy and a decision from the Building Official.

There being no further business, Mr. Geisler made a motion that the meeting be adjourned. Mr. Boyd seconded the motion, with unanimous approval.

Dr. Charles M. Owens, Chairman

W. Garrett Jackson, Secretary